

# Rechtsgeschichte Legal History

[www.rg.mpg.de](http://www.rg.mpg.de)

<http://www.rg-rechtsgeschichte.de/rg27>  
Zitiervorschlag: Rechtsgeschichte – Legal History Rg 27 (2019)  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.12946/rg27/286-287>

Rg **27** 2019 286 – 287

**Peter Collin\***

## How to Describe the Law of the Welfare State?

---

\* Max-Planck-Institut für europäische Rechtsgeschichte, Frankfurt am Main, [collin@rg.mpg.de](mailto:collin@rg.mpg.de)

Dieser Beitrag steht unter einer Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License



# Rechtsgeschichte Legal History

[www.rg.mpg.de](http://www.rg.mpg.de)

<http://www.rg-rechtsgeschichte.de/rg27>  
Zitiervorschlag: Rechtsgeschichte – Legal History Rg 27 (2019)  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.12946/rg27/009-019>

Rg **27** 2019 9 – 19

## Inhalt

---

Dieser Beitrag steht unter einer Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License



<b>António Manuel Hespanha †</b>	22	Thirty Years of Studies on Prosopography of Portuguese Early Modern Jurists
<b>Jean-Louis Halpérin</b>	51	A German Linkage Between Criminal Law and Law of Nations as Academic Disciplines

## Fokus focus

### Tridentine Marriage

<b>Benedetta Albani</b>	66	Global Perspectives on Tridentine Marriage. An Introduction
<b>David L. d'Avray, Werner Menski</b>	71	Authenticating Marriage: The Decree <i>Tametsi</i> in a Comparative Global Perspective
<b>Ana de Zaballa Beascochea</b>	90	Indian Marriage Before and After the Council of Trent: From pre-Hispanic Marriage to Christian Marriage in New Spain
<b>Pilar Latasa</b>	105	Tridentine Marriage Ritual in Sixteenth- to Eighteenth-century Peru: From Global Procedures to American Idiosyncrasies
<b>Robert C. Schwaller</b>	123	The Spiritual Conquest of Marriage: How the Holy Office and Council of Trent Attempted to Reform the Laity of New Spain
<b>María Elena Imolesi</b>	131	Doing the Same But With Different Arguments: Matrimonial Dispensations in the Indigenous and Spanish Population of Colonial Charcas
<b>Hélène Vu Thanh</b>	143	Introducing Tridentine Marriage: The Jesuits' Strategy in Japan (Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries)
<b>Marya Svetlana T. Camacho</b>	153	Marriage in the Philippines After the Council of Trent (Seventeenth to Eighteenth Centuries)
<b>Cecilia Cristellon</b>	163	The Roman Congregations and the Application of the <i>Tametsi</i> as an Instrument of Their Policies Towards Mixed Marriages in Europe (1563–1798)

<b>Thomas Duve, Fupeng Li</b>	174	Translating Weimar. Introductory Remarks
<b>Leticia Vita</b>	176	Weimar in Argentina: a Transnational Analysis of the 1949 Constitutional Reform
<b>Carlos M. Herrera</b>	184	Weimar, the South American Way
<b>Xin Nie</b>	195	The Chinese Constitutional Social Welfare Articles Before 1949 – Comparison With the Weimar Constitution
<b>Fupeng Li</b>	207	Becoming Policy. Cultural Translation of the Weimar Constitution in China (1919–1949)
<b>Donal K. Coffey</b>	222	The Influence of the Weimar Constitution on the Common Law World

<b>Stefan Vogenauer</b>	232	Introduction: Two <i>Oxford Handbooks</i> on the History of Law
<b>Caspar Ehlers</b>	237	Multiple Universen der Rechtsgeschichte
<b>Zeynep Yazici Caglar</b>	241	Comparative Legal History – But How?
<b>Anselm Küsters, Laura Volkind, Andreas Wagner</b>	244	Digital Humanities and the State of Legal History. A Text Mining Perspective
<b>Luisa Stella de Oliveira Coutinho Silva</b>	260	Sexy Legal History: Mapping Sexualities in a Handbook
<b>Victoria Barnes, Sean Bottomley, Anselm Küsters</b>	265	Economic History as Legal History
<b>Mariana Dias Paes</b>	271	What About African Legal History?
<b>Christoph H.F. Meyer</b>	276	Zweimal mittelalterliches Kirchenrecht
<b>José Luis Egío García</b>	280	Towards a New Narrative of Natural Law Thinking in Early Modern Scholasticism
<b>Aleksi Ollikainen-Read</b>	284	Paradigm Choices in Anglo-American Law of Obligations
<b>Peter Collin</b>	286	How to Describe the Law of the Welfare State?
<b>Gerd Bender</b>	288	Im Labyrinth
<b>Jan-Henrik Meyer</b>	291	A Plea for More Historical Awareness in Environmental Law

<b>Guido Pfeifer</b>	296	(No) Hard Feelings! Philipp Ruch, »Ehre und Rache«
<b>Karla Escobar</b>	297	Agresivamente histórico y global John Brooke et al. (eds.), State Formations
<b>Georg May</b>	300	Kanonistik im Spiegel von Kanonisten Philipp Thull (Hg.), 60 Porträts aus dem Kirchenrecht
<b>Elisabetta Fiocchi Malaspina</b>	305	Forme di proprietà nel tempo e nello spazio Georgy Kantor, Tom Lambert, Hannah Skoda (eds.), Legalism: Property and Ownership
<b>Daniel S. Allemann</b>	308	Eine Genealogie spanischen Rechtsdenkens Rafael Domingo, Javier Martínez-Torrón (Hg.), Great Christian Jurists in Spanish History
<b>Manuela Bragagnolo</b>	310	Un atto culturale Hugo Beuvant et al. (dir.), Les traductions du discours juridique
<b>Roland Scheel</b>	312	Vom langsamen Werden dänischer Königsmacht Nils Hybel, The Nature of Kingship c. 800–1300
<b>Philipp N. Spahn</b>	315	Tripartite Legal Knowledge Stephan Dusil, Wissensordnungen des Rechts
<b>Caspar Ehlers</b>	317	Kanonisches Recht nach dem Investiturstreit Melodie H. Eichbauer, Danica Summerlin (Hg.), The Use of Canon Law in Ecclesiastical Administration, 1000–1234
<b>Caspar Ehlers</b>	319	Wer spiegelt wen? Lucas Wüsthof, Schwabenspiegel und Augsburger Stadtrecht
<b>Caspar Ehlers</b>	320	Flexible Prediger Cornelia Linde (Hg.), Making and Breaking the Rules
<b>Victoria Barnes</b>	322	Big Business Dave De ruysscher, Albrecht Cordes et al. (eds.), The Company in Law and Practice

- |  |     |   |
|--|-----|---|
| <b>Albrecht Cordes</b>                         | 324 | Zünfte und Wirtschaftswachstum<br>Sheilagh Ogilvie, <i>The European Guilds. An Economic Analysis</i>  |
| <b>Andrzej Gulczyński</b>                      | 327 | Ein Kompendium in Wort und Bild<br>Heiner Lück, <i>Der Sachsenspiegel</i>   |
| <b>Thomas Simon</b>                            | 329 | Ohne Gleichen: württembergische »Ehrbarkeit«<br>Nina Kühnle, <i>Wir, Vogt, Richter und Gemeinde</i>   |
| <b>Bernd Kannowski</b>                         | 332 | <i>Vae cupidae legum iuventuti</i> – jugendgefährdendes Schrifttum!<br>Gabriele von Olberg-Haverkate, <i>Die Textsorte Rechtsbücher</i>           |
| <b>Stéphane Péquignot</b>                      | 336 | Pour une relecture des traités diplomatiques de la fin du Moyen Âge<br>Gesa Wilangowski, <i>Frieden schreiben im Spätmittelalter</i>              |
| <b>Daniel S. Allemann</b>                      | 338 | Re-reading Vitoria<br>Francisco de Vitoria, <i>Relecciones jurídicas y teológicas</i>   |
| <b>Pamela Alejandra Cacciavillani</b>          | 341 | La importancia de no ser llamados <i>Indigenous Peoples</i><br>Irene Watson (ed.), <i>Indigenous Peoples as Subjects of International Law</i>     |
| <b>Petr Kreuz</b>                              | 342 | Aus der polnischen Kriminalitätsforschung<br>Pawel Klint, Daniel Wojtucki (Hg.), <i>Przestępczość kryminalna w Europie Środkowej i Wschodniej</i> |
| <b>Otto Danwerth</b>                           | 345 | Rebels With a Cause in Spanish America<br>Gregorio Salinero, <i>Hombres de mala corte</i>   |
| <b>Luisa Stella de Oliveira Coutinho Silva</b> | 349 | Vozes femininas em espaços imperiais<br>Nora E. Jaffary, Jane E. Mangan, <i>Women in Colonial Latin America, 1526 to 1806</i>                     |
| <b>Heinz Mohnhaupt</b>                         | 351 | »Wer Hoheitsrechte hat, visitiert«<br>Anette Baumann, <i>Visitationen am Reichskammergericht</i>  |



<b>Claudia Curcuruto</b>	353	Rechtseinheit durch Reichsgerichte Josef Bongartz et al. (Hg.), Was das Reich zusammenhielt
<b>Oswaldo Rodolfo Moutin</b>	355	Barely Known Old Legal Texts Come to Light Juan Fernando Cobo Betancourt, Natalie Cobo (eds.), La legislación de la arquidiócesis de Santafé
<b>Manuel Bastías Saavedra</b>	357	Property and the Early Modern Condition Alan Greer, Property and Dispossession
<b>Thomas Duve</b>	359	Verstanden? Brian P. Owensby, Richard J. Ross (Hg.), Justice in a New World
<b>Michele Graziadei</b>	362	Not on the Other Side of the Channel! Martin Flohr, Rechtsdogmatik in England
<b>Rafael Diego-Fernández Sotelo</b>	365	El concepto de <i>formación protoestatal</i> en Hispanoamérica Horst Pietschmann, Acomodos políticos, mentalidades y vías de cambio
<b>Tilman Reppen</b>	368	Why Obey? Stefan Schweighöfer, Die Begründung der normativen Kraft von Gesetzen bei Francisco Suárez
<b>Francesco Giuliani</b>	370	A Global Perspective on <i>De Propaganda Fide</i> Giovanni Pizzorusso, Governare le missioni, conoscere il mondo nel XVII secolo
<b>Manuela Bragagnolo</b>	372	Probabilmente moralmente legittime Stefania Tutino, Uncertainty in Post-Reformation Catholicism
<b>Albrecht Cordes</b>	375	CHILE und die Geschichte des Versicherungsrechts Phillip Hellwege (Hg.), A Comparative History of Insurance Law in Europe ders., The Past, Present, and Future of Tontines ders., A History of Tontines in Germany
<b>Gustavo César Machado Cabral</b>	378	Clerical Misconduct in Colonial Brazil Pollyanna Gouveia Mendonça Muniz, Réus de Batina

<b>Filippo Ranieri</b>	380	Englische Verfassung <i>à la française</i> Tanguy Pasquier-Briand, La réception de la Constitution anglaise au XIX <sup>e</sup> siècle
<b>Stefan Kroll</b>	384	Zerbrochen am Kontext Jennifer Pitts, Boundaries of the International
<b>Justine Keli Collins</b>	386	To be or not to be a True Born Englishmen Dana Y. Rabin, Britain and its Internal Others
<b>Heinz Mohnhaupt</b>	387	»Am Ende stritt man um Akten« Alexander Denzler, Über den Schriftalltag im 18. Jahrhundert
<b>Carlos Petit</b>	390	Luces y sombras sobre la <i>Sombra de Vitoria</i> Ignacio de la Rasilla del Moral, In the Shadow of Vitoria
<b>Mariana Dias Paes</b>	392	Novas perspectivas para uma História Atlântica do Direito Mariana Pinho Candido, Fronteiras da escravidão Cristina Nogueira da Silva, A construção jurídica dos territórios ultramarinos portugueses Flávia Maria de Carvalho, Sobas e os homens do rei
<b>Mathias Reimann</b>	397	How the United States Failed to Establish a »Government of Laws« James R. Maxeiner, Failures of American Methods of Lawmaking
<b>Paolo Becchi</b>	401	Was ist uns Thibaut? Christian Hattenhauer et al. (Hg.), A.F.J. Thibaut (1772–1840). Bürger und Gelehrter
<b>Adriane Sanctis de Brito</b>	404	In the Name of Civilisation Michel Erpelding, Le droit international anti-esclavagiste des »nations civilisées«
<b>Matthias Schwaibold</b>	406	Vorgebliche Antworten auf eine falsche Frage Daniel Arne Wyss, Wie viel Bluntschli steckt in Huber?
<b>Maddalena Burelli</b>	410	Una dichiarazione di indipendenza dimenticata Lucrecia Enríquez, Historia, memoria y olvido del 12 de febrero de 1818

<b>Raquel R. Sirotti</b>	412	Built to Colonize Dior Konaté, Prison Architecture and Punishment in Colonial Senegal
<b>Bruno Lima</b>	414	Liberated Africans With Rights? Beatriz Mamigonian, Africanos livres: a abolição do tráfico de escravos no Brasil
<b>Christoph Resch</b>	416	Vertragsgeschichte mit Charles Dickens Anat Rosenberg, Liberalizing Contracts. Nineteenth Century Promises
<b>Michael Stolleis</b>	418	»Im Reiche und in den Ländern müssen nach Maßgabe der Gesetze Verwaltungsgerichte ... bestehen« (Art. 107 Weimarer Reichsverfassung) Karl-Peter Sommermann, Bert Schaffarzik (Hg.), Handbuch der Geschichte der Verwaltungsgerichtsbarkeit
<b>Leticia Vita</b>	420	Volver a los clásicos, volver a Sinzheimer Otto Ernst Kempfen, Hugo Sinzheimer
<b>Simon Groth</b>	424	Wie wir wurden, wer wir waren Johannes Liebrecht, Die junge Rechtsgeschichte
<b>Milan Kuhli</b>	426	Diskursgeschichte des Völkerstrafrechts Annette Weinke, Gewalt, Geschichte, Gerechtigkeit
<b>Michael Stolleis</b>	429	Der Strom kommt aus der Steckdose Dirk van Laak, Alles im Fluss. Die Lebensadern unserer Gesellschaft
<b>Warren Swain</b>	432	»The narrow ways of English folk« Mark Lunney, A History of Australian Tort Law 1901–1945
<b>Valeria Vegh Weis</b>	434	»Haz lo que digo y no lo que hago« Daniel Brückenhaus, Policing Transnational Protest
<b>Philipp Siegert</b>	436	Öffentliches Recht in Frankreich, 1914–1918 Elina Lemaire (Hg.), La Grande Guerre et le droit public Comité d'Histoire du Conseil d'État (Hg.), Le Conseil d'État et la Grande Guerre

- Anna Clara Lehmann Martins** 439 A »diabolical Constitution« in Mexico  
Carmen-José Alejos Grau, Una historia olvidada e inolvidable
- Rahela Khorakiwala** 441 The Historicity of Law in India  
Aparna Balachandran, Bhavani Rashmi Pant (eds.), Iterations of Law: Legal Histories from India
- Marcelo Neves** 443 Constituição de Weimar, presente!  
Udo Di Fabio, Die Weimarer Verfassung  
Horst Dreier, Christian Waldhoff (orgs.), Das Wagnis der Demokratie
- Stefan Kroll** 446 Does the Present Matter?  
Marcus M. Payk, Frieden durch Recht?
- Hendrik Simon** 448 Das Alte in der neuen Ordnung  
Oona A. Hathaway, Scott J. Shapiro, The Internationalists
- Jasper Kunstreich** 451 Against Theory?  
Felix Lange, Praxisorientierung und Gemeinschaftskonzeption: Hermann Mosler
- Thomas Clausen** 453 From Prussia to the People's Court  
Tilman Pünder, In den Fängen des NS-Staates

**Anette Baumann** 458 Visuelle Evidenz.  
Beobachtungen zu Inaugenscheinnahmen und  
Augenscheinkarten am Reichskammergericht  
(1495–1806)

**Abbildungen** 462 illustrations

**Abstracts** 465 abstracts

**Autoren** 472 contributors

Peter Collin

## How to Describe the Law of the Welfare State?

About 200 years ago, legal concepts based on the idea of *formal* equality prevailed. Over the last 150 years, however, the law has tried on a large scale to establish *substantive* equality, or at least to alleviate social and economic imbalances. To this day, the law which has undertaken this task has grown in scope and become increasingly differentiated. It has become one of the most important components of modern legal systems and has a history with its own distinctive contours. The terms used to summarise the corresponding legal materials are manifold: law of the welfare state, law of the provident state (*état providence*) (François Ewald), social law, social welfare law, etc.

If one asks how this law was taken into account in the two *Oxford Handbooks*, one first comes across the contribution by Bruno Aguilera-Barchet in the *Oxford Handbook of European Legal History* (»The Law of the Welfare State«). In addition, Michael Stolleis discusses social law under National Socialism (»European Twentieth-Century Dictatorship and the Law«) in the same volume, and the *Oxford Handbook of Legal History* discusses the influence of welfare ideas on the development of contract law (Anat Rosenberg, »What Do Contracts Histories Tell Us About Capitalism?: From Origins and Distribution, to the Body and the Nation«). Outside this contribution, we find only a few scattered mentions of the topic. Thus it is noticeable that this legal matter – despite its significance – has received relatively little attention in the latter handbook. It is likely that this is the result of its editors' express intention to present research approaches rather than subject areas.

If the law of the welfare state is to be investigated historically, it must be borne in mind that the object of this analysis is difficult to delineate. It will certainly be possible to agree that the law of social assistance and the law of social insurance belong to it. But even the question of whether labour law is part of it has to be answered differently depending on the legal system. In addition,

social law elements can be found in many other areas of law. And finally, it should be noted that there is a lack of a coherent, traditional line of welfare state thinking, of any integrating great ideas at all, which makes a description of the pertinent history of ideas difficult. The welfare state has no Hobbes, no Adam Smith, no Rousseau and no Kant.<sup>1</sup> Describing the history of this law thus poses an enormous challenge.

In the following, I will discuss how Aguilera-Barchet met this challenge in his contribution. His chapter consists of two major sections, »An Essay on the Constitutional History of the Welfare State« and »The ›Role‹ of Law in the Welfare State«. Whether the first section can be called constitutional history is questionable. Basically, it is an extraordinarily stimulating brief history of social policy over the last two centuries, with a kind of prehistory stretching into the Middle Ages and the early modern period. Here Aguilera-Barchet describes the social policy debates and the social policy reforms that took place in various European countries, and traces how the welfare state developed as a certain type of organisation of the community. The text impressively unfolds various European perspectives. However, there is a lack of a clear legal-historical, above all constitutional-historical layout.

Only the second section opens up a genuinely legal-historical perspective. It deals with four thematic areas: 1. social citizenship (as the »second generation of fundamental rights«), 2. legal sources of the welfare state (here Aguilera-Barchet almost exclusively discusses labour law), 3. conflict resolution mechanisms of the welfare state (again focusing exclusively on labour law conflicts), 4. scholarly social law. As the details of the history of labour law are the subject of Gerd Bender's article in this *Forum* section, I will limit myself here to discussing only the prominent emphasis on labour law made by the author. This issue touches on the question of what the characteristic law of the

1 JÜRGEN KAUBE, Das Reflexionsdefizit des Wohlfahrtsstaates, in: STEPHAN LESSENICH (Hg.), Wohlfahrtsstaat-

liche Grundbegriffe. Historische und aktuelle Diskurse, Frankfurt / New York 2003, 41–54.

welfare state is. That in turn leads to the question how the author defines a »welfare state«. This is a central problem of Aguilera-Barchet's discussion.

For Aguilera-Barchet, the benchmark of the Western welfare state is the British model with tax-funded universal services as it was developed in the aftermath of the Second World War. By contrast, according to the author, Bismarck's model does not correspond to the system logic of the welfare state because it merely forced citizens to take out insurance. Put so categorically, this view seems problematic. The literature on the welfare state to date clearly assumes the historical existence of various different welfare state models, albeit some of them converging or appearing in mixed combinations. In view of this, it would have been appropriate to deal more extensively with this current state of scholarly opinion.

However, another circumstance weighs more heavily. As already mentioned, in the second part of his contribution Aguilera-Barchet deals – apart from fundamental social rights – almost exclusively with regulatory complexes of labour law. However, these complexes cannot be regarded as the characteristic regulatory instrument of the welfare state according to the Beveridge model. If one orients oneself towards these structures, the rules for the National Health Service, for example, would have to be addressed. The labour law regimes that the author deals with, above all labour protection laws, the law of collective bargaining and labour law jurisdiction, had already begun to emerge in the 19<sup>th</sup> century and have nothing to do with the system of tax-financed universal social services. This divergence between the model chosen as paradigmatic in the article's first part and the presentation of the related legal matters in the second results in a certain incoherence of presentation.

Following on from these remarks, I would like to conclude by highlighting a number of aspects that seem important if the law of the welfare state is to be presented from a historical perspective.

First of all, a pluralistic understanding of »welfare state« is required: there are several types, and each has its own characteristic law. A further task is to examine interdependencies, mixtures and convergences between these types. However, it is also possible – regardless of the type – to identify certain common core problems, which I will only sketch briefly here.

First, every welfare state is first and foremost a provident state. It legislates in order to prevent risks (accident, illness, invalidity, unemployment), which are no longer considered an acceptable fate but seen as resulting in a need for action which becomes a public task. This also means a considerable break with previous ideas about the purpose of law. It no longer serves only the appropriate balancing of conflicting interests but is increasingly becoming the law of social risk prevention and risk aftercare.

Second, a legal history of the welfare state must not only concentrate on those areas of law that, because of their outstanding political significance, appear to be particularly attractive for historical consideration, i.e. above all regarding constitutional and labour law. The complex issues of social insurance law and social assistance law are essential for the functioning of the welfare state. In Aguilera-Barchet's presentation, these matters are underrepresented. They are addressed in the first part, but their legal dimension is not discussed in the second.

Third, the law of the welfare state must not only be understood as a law of social benefits, but also to a large extent as an organisational law, determining which organisation undertakes which tasks, equipped with which legal means. Private and semi-state actors thus also come to the fore. This directs attention from the welfare *state* to welfare *governance*.

Fourth, the law of the welfare state must be understood in a much stronger way as a special order that incorporates different rationalities in a particular way: those of the political system, the economic system, the educational system, the health system and the religious system. The latter can easily be made plausible if one considers the case of Germany, where the idea of subsidiarity (deriving from Catholic social thought) was for a long time one of the constitutive principles of the welfare state.

These thoughts certainly lead beyond what can feasibly be discussed within the limited pages of a handbook chapter. In this respect, the discussion of such handbook articles also serves as a starting point for reflections on the various perspectives from which a legal history of the welfare state can be written.

